



NSF ADVANCE: Institutional Transformation
Texas A&M University

Year 2 Interim Report 3
May 1, 2011 – August 31, 2012

Principal Investigator
Sherry Yennello

Co-Principal Investigators
Robin Autenrieth
Stephanie Payne
Karan Watson

Program Director
Christine Kaunas

Cooperative Agreement No. HRD-1008385
Submitted September 3, 2012

Table of Contents

SUMMARY	1
ENGAGING THE UNIVERSITY COMMUNITY	2
ENGAGING THE ADVANCE COMMUNITY.....	3
UPCOMING EVENTS.....	3
PROGRAM ACTIVITIES	3
Overview	3
CLIMATE CHANGE.....	4
LEAD Program	4
Faculty-Staff Interaction.....	4
Student Diversity Workshops	5
Merit Pool Incentives	7
Departmental Mini Grants.....	7
SUCCESS ENHANCEMENT	7
ADVANCE Scholar Program.....	7
Administrative Fellow Program.....	8
Success Circles	10
RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION	11
Roadmap Workshop.....	11
Award and Search Committee Training	12
ADVANCE Speaker Series.....	13
Faculty Recognition.....	13
EVALUATION.....	14

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A – Year 2 External Evaluation Report

APPENDIX B – Baseline Retention Analysis

SUMMARY

The summer months of 2012 have been a period of continued, steady progress. Key accomplishments for the ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty from May 1 to August 31 include significant progress on the Award & Search Committee, establishing a new direction for the Student Diversity Activity, identifying five key strategies for the Faculty-Staff Interaction Committee, sustained cultivation and support of the Success Circle that is focusing on writing, and initial refinement of the Roadmap Workshop.

Development efforts advanced substantially during this time as well. We continued to collaborate with the Development Officers in the STEM colleges, and we submitted two pre-proposals that both resulted in invitations to submit full proposals for efforts that **complement the ADVANCE Center's mission. One effort may result in two** Clare Boothe Luce professorships for women STEM faculty: one in the College of Engineering and one in the College of Science. The other effort may result in an Elsevier Foundation-funded Dependent Care Travel Program so that women STEM faculty can access funds to cover incremental dependent care costs related to professional travel (e.g. conferences).

This was also a period of key staffing changes for the Program. The Dean of Faculties and ADVANCE Co-Principal Investigator, Antonio Cepeda-Benito, left the university. Dr. Michael Benedik has been named as Interim Dean of Faculties. Dr. Benedik is a full professor in the Department of Biology and the Faculty of Genetics. He currently serves as Faculty Ombuds Officer, and he was elected as Speaker of the Faculty Senate for the past academic year. It is anticipated that a new Dean of Faculties will be in place by the end of the year. The ADVANCE Director met with Dr. Benedik and Associate Dean of Faculties Blanca Lupiani (who was placed in her position through the ADVANCE Administrative Fellows Program) to ensure a smooth transition.

Two internal evaluators, Angela Bies and Edwina Dorch, also left the university. In consultation with the ADVANCE Leadership Team, the Evaluation Team Leaders (Lori Taylor and Jeff Froyd) put a new plan in place. Effective September 1, Dr. Joanna Lahey, an Assistant Professor in the TAMU Bush School of Government and Public Service, will join the Evaluation Team. Dr. Lahey received her Ph.D. in economics at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, and her area of research focuses on discrimination. Dr. Taylor has met with Dr. Lahey to brief her on the project, and further meetings early this fall will ensure a smooth transition.

The Social Science Studies and Evaluation Teams continued to meet regularly and make progress on the research and evaluation plans. Significant advances for the Social Science Studies Team during this time include analyses of the codes assigned to student evaluations, **a summary report regarding a survey of the Women's Faculty Network** Mentoring Program, six interviews with ADVANCE Fellows and their colleagues, and analyses of 2009 climate data to inform items for inclusion in the 2012 climate survey. The Evaluation team finalized their baseline analysis of retention data, worked with administration to raise awareness about possible salary inequities, continued work on cleaning and analyzing space allocation data, and conducted a preliminary analysis of start-up packages.

ENGAGING THE UNIVERSITY COMMUNITY

The Program Director continued to attend monthly campus Work-Life Committee meetings to discuss workplace issues. She also continued to participate in monthly meetings with college diversity leaders to discuss cross-college synergies and strategies. Further, ADVANCE is again partnering with the **Women's Faculty Network at the August 20th New Faculty Orientation** and began to attend WFN meetings regularly. Ms. Kaunas **also met with the Interim Director of the Women's Resource Center to discuss synergies and collaboration.** The key outcome of **this meeting is to initiate and establish a women's consortium** that is composed of leaders from the women-centered groups across campus (including the ADVANCE Center, **Women's Administrator Network, Women's and Gender Studies Program, Women's Faculty Network, the Women's Resource Center** etc.). The goal is to further enable synergies and collaborations among these groups.

Efforts to partner with other campus stakeholders on augmenting child care services also continued; the Director and Social Science Studies Team Leader Dr. Stephanie Payne continued working with the Dean of Liberal Arts (and ADVANCE IAB member / Administrative Fellow Program Activity Leader) who is championing this effort. A survey to further assess childcare needs will be launched shortly.

Starting in January, 2012, the ADVANCE Center began advocating for University participation in the formation of a southern Texas Higher Education Recruitment Consortium (HERC). The primary purpose of a HERC is to maintain regional, web-based search engines that include listings for faculty (and staff) positions at member institutions. ADVANCE sees this as a means of providing department heads with another tool to diversify their faculty search pools and aid with the placement of dual career faculty members. This effort has finally come to fruition through the offices of the Dean of Faculties and Human Resources. The recently released 2012 Affirmative Action Plan Summary (a set of policies and procedures to eliminate barriers to employment for minorities and women) indicated that Texas A&M will "collaborate with other higher education institutions to form a regional Higher Education Recruitment Consortium (HERC). Texas A&M will be one of the founding regional members and the target effective **date will be Spring 2013.**" **ADVANCE will continue to follow this new practice to determine how it is used in the departments.**

The ADVANCE Director and the Activity Leader of the Faculty-Staff Interaction Committee presented focus group findings to the University Diversity Operations Committee (May 24) which is led by ADVANCE Co-investigator and Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity. They also presented to the Associate Vice President for Human Resource and Administrative Services (also on the ADVANCE IAB) and her Leadership Team (July 20), as well as the Associate and Assistant Directors of the Employee Assistance Program (July 26). Meetings with other key stakeholders (e.g. University Staff Council) are currently being scheduled.

Finally, the Planning Committee continued to identify and engage additional advocates in each of the 39 Target Departments to further extend our reach.

ENGAGING THE ADVANCE COMMUNITY

Efforts to engage the ADVANCE community during the reporting period included continued participation in monthly AIM meetings and hosting a visit from the University of Michigan STRIDE Team (May 8). Additionally, our External Evaluator, Sandra Laursen, made her annual visit to campus on May 9 (see Appendix A). The ADVANCE PI attended the NSF Joint Annual Meeting and presented a poster (June 12-14), and the ADVANCE Director attended the Women in Engineering Programs and Advocates Network Conference in Columbus, OH (June 25-27) which had a focus on engaging ADVANCE. Also, Ms. Kaunas recently joined the External Advisory Board for the Louisiana Tech ADVANCE-PAID grant. She attended a board meeting by phone (August 14) to engage in their Year 3 Evaluation effort.

UPCOMING EVENTS

- The *Advancing STEM through the Participation of Women Faculty of Color* conference will be held October 11-12. A study including the ADVANCE Scholars, their internal advocates, and their external mentors is tentatively planned for October.
- The next TAMU Climate Survey is tentatively scheduled for fall, 2012.
- Speakers for the upcoming year will be announced in September for the ADVANCE Speaker Series.
- The awardee for the first Faculty Mentoring Award in the College of Agriculture and Life Sciences will be announced in September. This award was established through a Departmental Mini Grant that was awarded as a cross-departmental effort to the college's women faculty network known as **AWESOME**.
- An updated ADVANCE website with greater functionality will be launched in September.
- A call for additional members of the Success Circles Writing Club will be made in September, and an additional workshop on writing will be held in October.

PROGRAM ACTIVITIES

Overview: There are a total of 12 ADVANCE activities that are designed to increase gender equity by transforming Texas A&M University for women STEM faculty. Each activity is aligned with one or more of the five Psychologically Healthy Workplace (PHW) practices – the underlying, evidence-based framework for this initiative. The activities are organized into 3 broad categories: Climate Change, Success Enhancement and Recruitment and Retention. Each category has two Co-Chairs that oversee the related activities, an Activity Leader, and a committee made up of individuals from various units throughout the university. Each of the 12 activities is being evaluated separately and collectively as a part of an overarching analysis of institutional transformation. Social science research studies are being conducted in concert with 6 of the activities.

CLIMATE CHANGE

Co-Chairs - Christine Stanley and Mary Jo Richardson

Workplace climate is a major factor affecting women STEM faculty's success and efficacy at Texas A&M. In order to address this, the ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is engaged in 5 Climate Change Activities which are designed to improve the work environment by reducing bias. Christine Stanley, Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity, and Mary Jo Richardson, Regents Professor, Department of Oceanography, Co-Chair this effort.

LEAD Program

Activity Leader - Simon Sheather

Activity Summary: The ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is collaborating with the Dean of Faculties and the Office of the Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity to enhance existing diversity training for current and newly appointed Department Heads. The goal of the LEAD Program is to expand training related to implicit bias and provide further support to help Department Heads improve departmental climate for all faculty and meet diversity goals related to women STEM faculty. To that end, the committee is establishing a leadership program for Department Heads that will provide workshops each semester (and possibly during the summer sessions) that focus on issues related to department leadership; training related to implicit bias will be woven into each workshop.

Activity Update: During the reporting period, a new Department Head from the College of Veterinary Medicine, Evelyn Castiglioni, joined this committee. Not only is Dr. **Castiglioni's experience and input energizing this committee, she is key in developing** relationships with her college that will aid in institutionalization in the future. Most recent developments for this activity include a focus on a department head survey to assess what issues department heads feel they need the most in terms of professional development. (This survey will also include questions for the Roadmap Workshop which will ask for their assessment related to participation.)

Faculty-Staff Interaction

Activity Leader - Merna Jacobsen

Activity Summary: A positive working relationship between faculty and staff is critical to the success of the University. The ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is working to increase faculty and staff awareness of intentional or unintentional bias toward female faculty by expanding existing training related to gender equity and diversity. The first phase of this activity includes faculty and staff focus groups conducted to inform program design; however, the data will also be used as baseline information and focus groups will be conducted in the future for comparison purposes.

Activity Update: Over the summer months, the Activity Leader led the committee through a facilitated process --based on the focus group findings-- to identify strategies for implementation. The five strategies identified as most feasible are:

1. Implement a unit-based model with a point team consisting of a faculty member and a staff member in STEM colleges or departments (depending on size) Note: This dovetails **with the Planning Committee's efforts to identify additional advocates** within units
2. Utilize distal exit interview data to further identify faculty climate issues
3. Implement several approaches to fostering understanding of roles (including workshops for academic staff about working in the faculty culture , understanding concerns of female faculty, educating faculty on staff demands)
4. Establish an advocate/ombuds role and process for staff who work in academic units
5. Provide tools for department heads (i.e. guidelines on how/when to incorporate staff into committees)

It should be noted that these strategies are much more aligned with what was expressed **in the focus group rather than the originally proposed "staff training" program**. The committee is now addressing each strategy and planning for implementation. In addition to these strategies, the Program Director and Activity Leader are continuing to present the focus group findings to key stakeholders as a means of raising awareness about the faculty-staff interaction issues.

Social Science Study Summary: This activity is the focus of one of the six ADVANCE social science research studies. **The working title for this effort is "Reducing Staff & Student Implicit Biases: Campus Climate Perceptions before and after Diversity Workshops and Training."** ADVANCE Co-Investigator Kathi Miner is leading this analysis of longitudinal **Campus Climate Survey data that assesses women STEM faculty's perceptions of personal and vicarious experiences of disrespect from staff and undergraduate students** (see Student Diversity Workshops below) before and after diversity training. The next Campus Climate Survey is tentatively scheduled for fall 2012. A first draft of the survey is complete.

Social Science Study Update: In an effort to get staff buy-in for the need for staff → faculty incivility training, the Social Science Studies Team developed and administered a faculty → staff incivility survey. Data collection was completed in February, 2012. Two-hundred-twenty-three staff (79% female, 86% White) from ADVANCE Target Departments completed the survey for a 29% response rate. We are preparing the data file for analysis (e.g., creating scales). The data generated from this survey will supplement the analyses mentioned above.

Student Diversity Workshops

Activity Leader - CJ Woods

Activity Summary: In order to improve the workplace climate for women STEM faculty, the ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is engaged in an effort to teach students that respecting all faculty is part of the culture of Texas A&M. The Center collaborated with members of the TAMU Performance Studies Department to develop interactive theater experiences that address issues of implicit bias, prejudices, and stereotypes of women and minorities.

Activity Update: **Area of Difficulty/Resistance:** The committee determined that “Gorilla Theater” is not an effective technique on our campus. Given the content of our skits and our student culture, a “captive audience” with clear leadership present is required for active student engagement. Further, it has been established that working with the Performance Studies Program to create and perform the skits was too costly for the desired outcome of large scale dissemination of diversity skits. Consequently, the committee is no longer working with this group. **Best Ideas Yet:** As previously reported, the committee revisited the idea of performances at Fish Camp and is now fully pursuing this strategy. During the summer months, the Program Director met with the Activity Leader (also the Assistant Vice President for Student Affairs) and members of TAMU’s Fish Camp leadership to explore ways to integrate diversity skits into the Camp’s programming. The Director and the Activity Leader attended one day of the four-day student orientation Fish Camp to better assess the setting for the Student Diversity Activity. The Director will meet again with Fish Camp leadership in September to plan for implementation in the 2013 camp sessions. New Student Conferences are also currently being explored. All new undergraduates are required to attend this event. Additional settings will be pursued once programming is firmly established in Fish Camp and New Student Conferences. In terms of performers, the committee now plans to work with other groups on campus that currently perform diversity skits at a much lower cost.

Social Science Study Summary: The Student Diversity Workshops are being conducted in concert with two ADVANCE social science research studies. The **first** study, currently titled “Reducing Student Implicit Biases: Analysis of Course Evaluations before and after Student Diversity Workshops,” is led by Co-Principal Investigator Stephanie Payne. This study is a **content analysis of students’ teaching evaluations pre- and post-student diversity workshops/performances** and will examine whether or not women STEM faculty receive less disrespectful comments on their teaching evaluations after the student diversity performances. The **second** study, “Reducing Staff & Student Implicit Biases: Campus Climate Perceptions before and after Diversity Workshops and Training” is led by ADVANCE Co-Investigator Kathi Miner. This study is an analysis of longitudinal Campus Climate Survey data and will assess women STEM faculty’s perceptions of personal and vicarious experiences of disrespect from staff (see Faculty-Staff Interaction) and undergraduate students before and after diversity training.

Social Science Study Update: For the **first** study, the Social Science Research Team is content coding qualitative comments in course evaluations. A paper summarizing the analyses to date is being prepared to submit to the 2013 Society of Industrial and Organizational Psychology conference (submission deadline September 12, 2012). Course evaluation data from the spring of 2012 have been requested from university officials. For the **second** study, anticipated fall 2012 faculty responses to questions concerning interactions with students will be analyzed and compared to the 2009 climate survey data. The next Campus Climate Survey is tentatively scheduled for fall of 2012. A first draft of the climate survey has been completed and will be submitted to the NSF once a final version is available (likely September).

Merit Pool Incentives

Activity Leader - Christine Stanley

Activity Summary: Christine Stanley, the Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity (VPAPD) and ADVANCE Co-Investigator, and her Council on Climate and Diversity (CCD) annually assess the progress made by each university unit (academic colleges as well as non-academic units) toward reaching diversity goals. The ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is working with Dr. Stanley's office to leverage this new institutional practice to further the goals of the ADVANCE program (e.g. participant tracking for Departmental Mini-Grants serves both ADVANCE and university diversity reporting requirements).

Activity Update: ADVANCE Co-Investigators Mindy Bergman and Kathi Miner continue to consult with various units through the Diversity Operations Committee (DOC) to assist them in meeting the assessment plan goals for their units. (The DOC is the operational committee formed under the 2009 TAMU Campus Diversity Plan to assist with ongoing planning, implementation, assessment, and evaluation of University and unit progress with respect to accomplishing goals related to accountability, climate, and equity.)

Departmental Mini Grants

Activity Leader – Pending

Activity Summary: The aim of this activity is to support departments in their diversity efforts and to provide an avenue for strategies that promote the success of women STEM faculty at Texas A&M. Mini-grants for innovative projects are being awarded annually to individual departments based on how well the proposed projects support the goals of the ADVANCE program.

Activity Update: Funding for the 2012-13 Departmental Mini-Grants began on July 1. A new Activity Leader for this effort is still pending. The Director and Activity Co-Chair, Mary Jo Richardson, plan to identify and invite someone to replace the departed Activity Leader for this effort by the end of the year.

SUCCESS ENHANCEMENT

Co-Chairs – [Pending] and Dorothy Shippen

The Success Enhancement component of ADVANCE activities is designed to foster the professional development of women STEM faculty. There are 3 Success Enhancement Activities that have been established to foster the professional development of women STEM faculty. Antonio Cepeda-Benito, Dean of Faculties and Associate Provost, and Dorothy Shippen, Department of Biochemistry & Biophysics, Co-Chair this effort.

ADVANCE Scholar Program

Activity Leaders - Christine Stanley and Becky Petitt

Activity Summary: The ADVANCE Scholar Program intends to increase likelihood of success of underrepresented women STEM faculty members, particularly women of color, by providing as mentors eminent scholars in their fields. The ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is also establishing a national conference for underrepresented women in STEM, the first of which is scheduled for October 11-12, 2012.

Activity Update: To date, seven Scholars have met with their mentors face-to-face and two are currently planning travel to meet their mentors. Since our last update, one of our Scholars has left the university and is now employed as a faculty member at a Historically Black College. Her internal advocate is following-up to learn more about the reasons for her departure. We have also learned that one Scholar was denied tenure, so she too will leave the university in the near future. This Scholar, however, remains with the program as we believe that continuing to provide mentoring and support will aid in her transition. The Scholar who left the university is Black, and the soon-to-be-departed Scholar is Hispanic. While some attrition is expected, these instances prompted us to urge our Internal Advocates to contact their Scholars more frequently and to intervene when possible.

We welcomed a new cohort of three Scholars, all from the College of Agriculture and Life Sciences. One resides in an ADVANCE Target Department (Wildlife and Fisheries Sciences) and two reside in non-targeted departments (Agricultural Leadership, Education, & Communications and Recreation, Parks and Tourism Science). Funding for the women in non-targeted departments is being provided by the college, not the NSF ADVANCE program. Two of the new Scholars identify as Black and one identifies as Hispanic. They have been assigned Internal Advocates and have identified their ideal Mentors/Eminent Scholars. Program co-chairs are in the process of assisting them in securing Mentors/Eminent Scholars.

Planning for the October 11-12, 2012 conference continues. The following individuals have agreed to serve as speakers: Bowen Loftin, President of Texas A&M University; Karan Watson, Provost of Texas A&M University; Christine Grant, Associate Dean of Faculty Development and Special Initiatives in the College of Engineering at North Carolina State University; Sandra Begay-Campbell of Sandia National Laboratories; Canan Bilen Green, North Dakota State University; Anthony DePass, Long Island University; Douglas Haynes, University of California, Irvine; and Cheryl Dickter, College of William and Mary. Additionally, Susan Fiske, a Psychologist from Princeton University who was nominated by the Psychology Department for the ADVANCE Speaker Series, will also speak. During the conference, there will be structured time for Scholars to meet with their Mentors/Eminent Scholars, and we will also dedicate time to program evaluation while we have the majority of program participants on campus.

Social Science Study Summary / Update: In our last report, we indicated a study including the ADVANCE Scholars, their internal advocates, and external mentors was tentatively planned for October 2012 (to replace the Success Circles study). However, the Activity Leader / ADVANCE Co-Investigator / Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity, ultimately felt that this population is too vulnerable for inclusion in a social science study related to mentoring, particularly since such a study was not mentioned when the Scholars initially applied to the program. The Social Science Study Team is again working with the Planning Committee to determine an alternate course of action.

Administrative Fellow Program

Activity Leader - José Luis Bermúdez

Activity Summary: This activity provides opportunities for women STEM faculty at the associate or full professor level to serve in developmental assignments in the offices of the

Provost, Deans of targeted colleges, Vice President for Research, VP and Associate Provost for Diversity, and the Dean of Faculties. Administrators are selected based on a proposed project, jointly developed by the faculty member with the college or administrative office, and supported jointly by the ADVANCE project and the host office.

Activity Update: On May 14, there was a **“Meet the ADVANCE Administrative Fellows”** event for those eligible faculty interested in the program. Five faculty members attended, including two from Cohort 2, to learn about **Cohort 1’s** experiences. Additionally, on July 10, the committee met with the unit hosts to hear their perspective of the program. Overall, the experiences were extremely positive and the hosts reported good matches with their Fellows. Things to consider for future cohorts include a need to:

- consider that managing split time (part-time faculty, part-time administrator) is challenging but doable
- further expand and diversify the pool of candidates; outreach to other administrative offices to establish fellowships
- provide better education on administrative terminology, budgeting, and procedures at the beginning of the fellowship
- strategize for ways to engage department heads to see bigger picture of university leadership (department heads would rather keep good people)
- **ensure “mission creep” doesn’t interfere with Fellow experience**

Many of these issues are already being addressed. For example, budget documents were **provided to cohort two and a “Budget 101” meeting is currently being scheduled.** Further, the Activity Leader/Cohort 1 host is reaching out to deans in other STEM colleges to encourage applications for the next round, and communications to the involved department heads are in the works.

The second cohort of three Fellows began July 1. The fourth Fellow is still pending for the Office of the Dean of Faculties and Associate Provost. It is currently uncertain, given the leadership change in this office, whether this position will be filled this year or not. Scheduling of the monthly lunch series for the Fellows to meet with campus administrators (President, Provost, VPs, Deans, etc.) continues.

Social Science Study Summary: In conjunction with this activity, Mindy Bergman is leading the social science study in which Administrative Fellows and their colleagues are interviewed. **The working title of the study is “Advancing Women into Leadership Positions: Effectiveness of the Administrative Fellows Program.”** The goal of this study is to develop a thick-description case study of women entering academic leadership and administration for the first time via a part-time, short duration position. The research questions focus on the changing beliefs and expectations of Fellows throughout their first year in administration, the fit of the position into the administrative unit (as part-time, short term administrative positions are relatively unusual at Texas A&M), and the effect on a variety of psychologically healthy workplace outcomes (e.g., work-life balance) and career trajectories as a typical faculty member (e.g., research productivity, student mentoring). All Administrative Fellows will be interviewed at three points during their first year of appointment (beginning, middle, end). Additionally, the sponsor of the

position (i.e., the unit head) as well as several peers and support staff will be interviewed at the beginning and end of the first year of **each Fellow's appointment**.

Social Science Study Update: Semi-structured interview protocols were developed for both the Fellows and their colleagues. Questions probe the efficacy and fit of the position into the host unit (all respondents), components of the psychologically healthy workplace model (especially work-life balance; Fellows), and the effects of joining administration on faculty career trajectories such as maintaining an active research program (all respondents). Qualitative analyses will be conducted once a sufficient number of interviews are transcribed.

To date, the first year cohort interviews for the College of Liberal Arts and the Office of the Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity are complete. The interviews for the Dean of Faculties office are on-going and nearly complete; interviewee travel schedules and personnel changes set this group of interviews back to the end of summer. The second year cohort **are all in the Provost's Office**. Interviews with the second year cohort and their hosts and colleagues are on-going, with eight expected to be completed by the end of August (six were already completed at the time this report was written) and two additional interviews expected in early September. We are also planning on expanding our research protocol to include an additional interview with Fellows, as the first group of Fellows all appear to be remaining in their position or in administration in general for at least one more year. This protocol will be submitted to IRB in early fall 2012, following the transcription of the end-of-first-year interviews with the first Fellows cohort.

Success Circles

Activity Leader - Jane Welsh

Activity Summary: The ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is organizing mentoring groups centered on personal and professional interests. This activity functions as a complement to existing one-on-one mentoring (**Women's Faculty Network, the Mexican American Latino Faculty Association and the Black Faculty Alliance**) and facilitates the development of social connections among women faculty with the goal of greater satisfaction and well-being. (Because this activity has not yielded multiple mentoring groups, the social science study originally planned to align with this activity has been abandoned and the corresponding IRB protocol closed.)

Activity Update: The Grant Writing Club continued to meet weekly during the summer months. At this point, the group is no longer focused solely on grants; it evolved into a general writing group where faculty use the weekly 1.5-2.0 hour meetings to write, review **each other's work, and connect**. Once school starts, another call will go out to women STEM faculty inviting them to join the group. We will either include newly interested faculty with this first group or start a second group (depending on the number of faculty who respond). In addition to the Writing Group, efforts to initiate an elder care group based on the **New Mom's group model are in the early stages**.

RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION

Co-Chairs - Robin Autenreith and Sarah Bednarz

While the number and diversity of women faculty at Texas A&M University has seen recent gains, a great need still exists to attract and keep women of excellence in the STEM fields. To that end, the ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty established 4 activities focused on Recruitment and Retention of women STEM faculty. Robin Autenreith, Co-PI and Associate Dean of Graduate Studies in the College of Engineering, and Sarah Bednarz, Associate Dean of Geography, are Co-Chairs for this effort.

Roadmap Workshop

Activity Leader - Ben Wu

Activity Summary: Formerly the Workshop for Early Career Academics, this activity is designed for internal (A&M) and external (non-A&M) post-doctoral researchers and Assistant Professors (in the first two years of their position) in STEM fields. The purpose of these annual workshops is to assist departments in the recruitment and retention of women STEM faculty.

Activity Update: The committee for this activity met regularly during the reporting period and is currently strategizing for modifications of the Roadmap Workshop. The committee believes it is important to hear from the Department Heads about their role in the workshop (nomination) and the impact they perceive the workshop had on their faculty. We are currently planning to survey the Department Heads on these issues along with issues pertinent to the LEAD Program.

Social Science Study Summary: Kathi Miner is conducting a study currently titled **"Repairing the Leaky Pipeline: Workshops for Early Career Academics."** This survey study investigates whether workshop attendees report higher levels of self-efficacy for negotiating and, in turn, higher levels of well-being than post-doctoral non-workshop attendees. The sample consists of post-doctoral researchers and Assistant Professors who participated in the workshop. Attendees were also asked to nominate a comparable friend (e.g., female colleague at a similar rank) to also complete the survey; these non-attendees will serve as a comparison group.

Social Science Study Update: All workshop participants were invited to participate in an online survey at the start of the workshop. Thirty-three participants completed the survey for an 81% response rate. In addition, 12% ($n = 4$) of survey respondents nominated a colleague to also participate. The data file for this study is currently being prepared for analysis.

Award and Search Committee Training

Activity Leader – César Malavé, Industrial and Systems Engineering

Activity Summary: The Dean of Faculties and the ADVANCE Center for Women faculty are working together to expand existing gender bias training for all members of review committees including search committees, committees making decisions on university and college awards, and committees making decisions on tenure and promotion.

Activity Update: Two faculty members from the University of Michigan STRIDE program visited the ADVANCE Center and College of Liberal Arts on May 8. The goals for the visit were threefold: 1) STRIDE presented to STEM deans and associate deans to garner further buy-in, 2) STRIDE presented their workshop to the College of Liberal Arts and activity committee members and 3) the STRIDE Team met with the activity committee to discuss lessons learned and review the progress that TAMU made to that point. **Areas of**

Difficulty/Resistance: This committee had struggled to get off the ground due to changes in leadership which led to inconsistencies in direction. **Best Ideas Yet:** We have established solid leadership, and the University of Michigan visit provided the committee with much needed direction and input as follows:

1. Form a group of influential and well-respected faculty to do presentations on implicit bias in search pools to other faculty members
2. Bring the faculty members together to study the literature
3. Finalize the presentation and prepare the influential faculty to do the presentation
4. Implement the program in Spring 2013
5. Bring additional faculty presenters on board thereafter to study the literature and do presentations

In order to implement this new plan, the committee identified a number of influential faculty members and spent the summer months recruiting them. The committee also decided that, in order to incentive participation for this substantial commitment, those **who complete the literature study would be known as “ADVANCE Eminent Scholars”** and would be featured on our website. ADVANCE Social Scientist, Mindy Bergman, and the Program Director designed an 8 session study schedule of the literature. The group starts meeting on August 28 and will meet twice monthly through the end of the year. Dr. Bergman will lead the study group. After the holidays, the Eminent Scholars will finalize the presentation and prepare to implement the first sessions with search committees. In the meantime, faculty videos will be made as a tool to be used in the presentations.

Social Science Study Summary: One of the six social science studies will be conducted around this activity; the study is currently titled “Improving Selection and Promotion of STEM Women Faculty: Reducing Search and Award Committee Biases.” Mindy Bergman is the lead social science studies team researcher on this study. The basic hypothesis for the social science study is that training will increase knowledge of equal opportunity laws and decrease explicit sex biases substantially as well as decrease implicit sex biases more moderately. The current plan is to use a Solomon 4-group design to compare pre-/post-training attitudes and knowledge regarding implicit sex biases and equal opportunity laws.

Social Science Study Update: Instruments for the social sciences study are in development as the course content becomes clearer. Current plans include using an implicit attitudes test, explicit attitudes measures (including Hostile and Benevolent Sexism, among others), and ratings of stimulus (faux) applicant folders and differences in ratings based on sex.

ADVANCE Speaker Series

Activity Leaders - Nancy Amato, Jennifer Welch, and Jodie Lutkenhaus

Activity Summary: The ADVANCE Speaker Series has two goals: 1) to bring in one or two senior women scientists and engineers per year who have also been active in gender and diversity issues to speak and 2) to bring in mid-career and senior women scientists and engineers that are nominated by STEM departments for recruiting purposes.

Activity Update: A call for nominations for the fall Speaker Series was sent out in early August. Nominations are due by August 19. Thereafter the committee will review the nominations and determine and announce the speakers. One speaker who was selected last spring, Susan Fiske (Professor of Psychology at Princeton University), is scheduled to visit in October. **Dr. Fiske's area** of expertise is a good fit with the October 11-12 "Advancing STEM through the Participation of Women Faculty of Color" **conference that is** being coordinated through the ADVANCE Scholar Program. As indicated above in the activity update for the Scholars Program, she will fill roles as both conference speaker and ADVANCE Speaker. Planning is currently underway.

Faculty Recognition

Activity Leader - Elena Castell-Perez

Activity Summary: This activity is focused on highlighting the success of women STEM faculty. **In collaboration with the Dean of Faculties office, the Women's Faculty Network,** the Women Engineering Faculty Interest Group, the Women Administrators Network, and the Vice President of Research, the ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is organizing events to recognize and publicize the achievements of women faculty.

Activity Update: The committee met in June to discuss the low turnout for the Faculty Forum on Awards. It is generally believed that in a climate with competing faculty priorities, there is no great sense of urgency about awards. The committee is currently investigating additional means of recognizing women faculty (e.g. spotlighting female faculty at major university events). Further, a new version of the ADVANCE website is about to launch and will allow for greater capacity to feature women STEM faculty.

EVALUATION

If the AVANCE program is successful, then at the end of five years, climate and faculty workplace practices at Texas A&M University will be more psychologically healthy than when the ADVANCE program was initiated. To achieve this goal, the project team developed a series of interrelated interventions designed to change the climate, enhance professional success, and improve the recruitment and retention of female faculty. Assessing and evaluating individual interventions (aside from tracking participation and for some interventions, satisfaction) would be nearly impossible because various interventions interact with one another. It would also be counterproductive because efforts focused on individual interventions would distract the Evaluation Team from its efforts to discern the extent to which institutional transformation is being achieved. Furthermore, the primary goal of the ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is organizational change, not scientific investigations of individual interventions. Therefore, the Evaluation Team is focusing on a more holistic analysis of **institutional transformation**. Its analysis will be embedded in the literature on institutional change and based on department-level data on faculty climate, faculty recruitment and retention, space allocations, start-up packages, and salaries. The underlying hypothesis is that departments which have been more engaged with ADVANCE will show greater improvements in climate, retention, recruitment, and resource balance over time. To address the hypothesis, a difference-in-difference approach will be used to evaluate extent to which engagement in ADVANCE activities can help to explain variations in departmental changes over time.

Recent work by the Evaluation team—Angela Bies, Edwina Dorch, Jeff Froyd and Lori Taylor—has focused on:

- Reviewing the public administration and nonprofit literatures on institutional change
- Identifying and compiling data needed for the analysis of institutional transformation
- Conducting the baseline analyses of faculty retention
- Conducting a preliminary analysis of start-up packages
- Helping the University clean and compile the administrative data on space allocations and start-up packages.

Table 1 below, the content of which was previously submitted, indicates the ADVANCE activity data that are being collected by the Evaluation Team for use in the analysis of institutional transformation.

Table 1
ADVANCE Activities and the Evaluation Data
for the Analysis of Institutional Transformation

Activity	Evaluation Data Being Collected
LEAD Program	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of which department heads have participated in diversity training, and how many hours of training they have received.
Faculty-Staff Interaction	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of the number of faculty and staff from each department who have participated in the Faculty-Staff Interaction Workshops.
Student Diversity Workshops	The evaluators will compare summary statistics from the TAMU student evaluations for treated sections with summary statistics on student evaluations for untreated sections.
Merit Pool Incentives	The Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity maintains these data. Note: Since the inception of ADVANCE, the Merit Pool Incentive has been dormant due to budgetary constraints. If and when these incentives are reinstated, the investigators will utilize data on whether or not each department receives funding through this program and the amount of funding each department receives. If possible, investigators will also utilize data on the process by which the awards were granted.
Departmental Mini Grants	Data collected from this effort includes all application forms submitted, information on awardee departments, minutes and notes taken from ADVANCE mini-grant committee meetings on process/program design, and the progress reports.
ADVANCE Speaker Series	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of the number of faculty from each department who have attended each speech, and the number of speakers proposed by each department, and the demographics of speakers in previous years.
Award and Search Committee Training	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database on the number of award and search committee members who have participated in diversity training, by department, and how many hours of training they have received.
Faculty Recognition	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of all award events and all faculty receiving awards.
Roadmap Workshop	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of all departments proposing candidates for the workshop, the demographic characteristics of all women attending the workshops and indicators for whether or not attendees were eventually hired by TAMU or another research institution.

Table 1 (continued)
ADVANCE Activities and the Evaluation Data
for the Analysis of Institutional Transformation

Activity	Evaluation Data Being Collected
Administrative Fellow Program	Data collected from this effort include all applications, information on awardees, minutes and notes taken from ADVANCE Administrative Fellow Program committee meetings on process/program design, and progress reports
ADVANCE Scholar Program	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database on all faculty who participate in the program and track their participation in professional development activities (publications, conference presentations, etcetera).
Success Circles	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of the departmental affiliations of all faculty members who participate in the program.

As is always the case with non-experimental research designs, there are other factors outside of our control that offer an alternative explanation for any institutional change. Table 2 below indicates some of the additional data that are being collected by the investigators on this project (also previously submitted).

As part of the analysis of institutional transformation, the data from Table 1 will be used to develop measures indicating the extent to which each TAMU department has engaged with the ADVANCE program. Scales will measure the degree of departmental engagement as a function of participation in ADVANCE activities and in ADVANCE design efforts. Similarly, the data from Table 2 will use used to develop measures indicating the extent to which each TAMU department has engaged with other diversity and climate change efforts on campus.

Table 2
Non-ADVANCE Activities and the Corresponding Evaluation Data

Non-ADVANCE Climate Activity	Evaluation Data Being Collected
<p>The Diversity Plan Grant: This collaborative effort will fund \$10,000 (Five \$2000 grants) for student-run initiatives that align with the TAMU Diversity Plan. The funding will be made available for recognized student organizations to create an initiative, or improve an existing initiative, that specifically supports one or more priorities of the Diversity Plan (Accountability, Climate, and Equity). (http://diversity.tamu.edu/Documents/DiversityPlan.pdf).</p>	<p>The Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity maintains these data. The investigators will utilize data on whether or not each department receives funding through this program and the amount of funding each department receives. If possible, investigators will also utilize data on the process by which the grants were awarded</p>
<p>Graduate Diversity Fellowships: These fellowships were established to attract students to TAMU who have a proven record of success in a diverse environment. Academic departments nominate prospective graduate students, and recipients are selected based on overall merit and the nominating department's statement of support. (http://ogs.tamu.edu/prospective-students/funding-information/fellowships/faculty-nominated-fellowships/)</p>	<p>The TAMU Office of Graduate Studies maintains these data and will share it with the investigators. Data collected from this effort will include publically available information on awardees from 2008-2016.</p>
<p>Teaching Excellence Award Program: The TAMU System's voluntary, student-selected Teaching Excellence Award Program was created to recognize excellence in classroom teaching. Individuals of all teaching levels will be eligible for awards based on students' responses from the uniform faculty evaluation form in eligible courses. The program was piloted in Fall 2008, expanded to include all 11 A&M System campuses in 2009, and suspended in 2011. (http://www.tamus.edu/offices/academic/student-recognition-award-for-teaching-excellence/)</p>	<p>The TAMU System Office of the Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs houses this information. Data collected from this effort will include all publically available information from awardees by department for the period of 2008-until the program's suspension in 2011.</p>

The baseline **retention analysis** has been completed (see appendix B). The Evaluation Team used regression analysis to examine faculty retention for the fiscal years 2001 to 2011. All tenured or tenure-track faculty with at least a half-time appointment in a STEM department have been included in the analysis. Faculty members in non-STEM departments from the two colleges that blend STEM and non-STEM departments (the College of Agriculture and Life Sciences and the College of Liberal Arts) were excluded from the baseline analysis.

As the attached report indicates, faculty turnover is a rare event at TAMU. On average, 95.3% of tenured or tenure track STEM faculty are retained from one year to the next. Retention rates for 2011 (the most recent year with data) were significantly lower than in prior years for some of the Colleges, a pattern that was undoubtedly influenced by a salary freeze initiated in 2009 and early retirement programs implemented in 2011. Probit analysis finds no evidence of systematic differences in faculty retention by sex, once other demographic characteristics -such as age and years since degree- were taken into account.

While there are no differences in retention for men and women among the tenured and tenure-track faculty as a whole, supplemental analysis suggests that there may be problematic differences in the retention of tenure-track faculty. A Cox proportional hazards model indicates that retention among tenure-track faculty in the College of Engineering is significantly lower for men than for women. In particular, the probability that engineering faculty are still at TAMU eight years after they were hired as assistant professors is 85% for males and only 68% for females. In contrast, the probability that STEM liberal arts faculty are still at TAMU eight years after they were hired as assistant professors is 65% for males and 81% for females. Moving forward, subsequent analysis will examine the extent to which differences in departmental climate help to explain the pattern of turnover among women faculty.

The administration continues to use the ADVANCE **salary analysis** (report previously submitted) to raise awareness about possible salary inequities. This summer, the Evaluation Team continued to meet with the College Deans about individuals with unusually high or low salaries, asking the Deans to confirm that the differentials could be explained by productivity or other factors outside the salary model. Plans to repeat this process (salary analysis, outlier identification, and conversations with College Deans) indicate that this aspect of the ADVANCE project is being institutionalized.

Moving forward, subsequent salary analyses will test for changes in the gender differential during the ADVANCE grant period and whether or not the degree of departmental engagement with ADVANCE and/or the nature of that engagement help to explain the gender differential.

The **space allocation** analysis will rely on newly developed data on space allocations at TAMU. Baseline data were collected by the facilities department in 2012 and are in the process of being cleaned by the ADVANCE Evaluation Team. These data will be the first to link individual records for TAMU faculty with descriptive characteristics of specific offices and laboratories. The baseline analysis will examine the extent to which there are gender differences in the allocation of office or laboratory spaces, conditional on the appropriate demographic characteristics of faculty. Subsequent analysis will examine changes, if any, in the gender pattern of space allocation.

The analysis of **start-up packages** relies on data developed in conjunction with the Dean of Faculties office. Departments were asked to provide such data for each new hire since 2005, and data have been collected from the five STEM colleges. A completed analysis will likely be submitted with the next interim report.

Another key element in assessment of institutional transformation is administration of a faculty campus **climate survey**. Plans have called for the survey to be administered every three years. To adhere to the plan, the survey should be administered in either fall semester 2012 or spring semester 2013. A final version of the survey, IRB approval for the survey, and plans to administer the survey and interpret the results are underway. The survey will allow examination of departmental variations in climate, which, in turn, may be related to differences in faculty retention.