



**NSF ADVANCE: Institutional Transformation
Texas A&M University**

**Year 2, Interim Report 2
December 1, 2011 – February 29, 2012**

Principal Investigator
Sherry Yennello

Co-Principal Investigators
Robin Autenrieth
Antonio Cepeda-Benito
Stephanie Payne
Karan Watson

Program Director
Christine Kaunas

Cooperative Agreement No. HRD-1008385
Submitted March 1, 2012

Table of Contents

SUMMARY	1
ENGAGING THE UNIVERSITY COMMUNITY	1
ENGAGING THE ADVANCE COMMUNITY	1
UPCOMING EVENTS	2
PROGRAM ACTIVITIES.....	2
Overview.....	2
CLIMATE CHANGE	2
LEAD Program.....	3
Faculty-Staff Interaction	3
Student Diversity Workshops	4
Merit Pool Incentives	5
Departmental Mini Grants	6
SUCCESS ENHANCEMENT.....	6
ADVANCE Scholar Program	6
Administrative Fellow Program	7
Success Circles	8
RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION	9
Roadmap Workshop	10
Award and Search Committee Training.....	10
ADVANCE Speaker Series.....	11
Faculty Recognition	12
EVALUATION UPDATE	14
APPENDIX A.....	Error! Bookmark not defined.

SUMMARY

The TAMU ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty continued to make progress on all aspects of the program during this reporting period. Center efforts focused on focus group data processing for the Faculty-Staff Interaction activity and event planning for the Faculty Recognition, Speaker Series, and Roadmap Workshop Activities. The Social Science and Evaluation Teams continued to meet regularly and are making appropriate progress on the research and evaluation plans for each activity. Significant advances for these teams included the launching of a Staff Survey for the Faculty-Staff Interaction activity, the completion of the baseline salary analysis (see Appendix A) and the collection of preliminary data on space allocation and start-up packages.

ENGAGING THE UNIVERSITY COMMUNITY

The Program Director continued to attend monthly campus Work-Life Committee meetings to discuss workplace issues and monthly meetings with college diversity leaders to discuss cross-college synergies and strategies. Additional university support was gained for ADVANCE activities, particularly the Student Diversity Workshops, when Ms. Kaunas met with the interim associate provost for undergraduate studies.

The Program Director has also initiated efforts to engage attendees of quarterly Executive Advisory & Development Counsels in the STEM colleges for development purposes. Further, the ADVANCE Team met with External Advisory Board member Carol Jordan to discuss development strategies. Ms. Jordan and the Program Director then met with STEM deans and development officers to share plans and garner support.

The Center continued efforts to partner with other campus stakeholders on augmenting child care services on campus, met with Bright Horizons, and is preparing to meet with STEM Deans to discuss financial models related to this effort.

ENGAGING THE ADVANCE COMMUNITY

Efforts to engage the ADVANCE community included continued participation in monthly AIM meetings and various communications with AIM members about various ADVANCE issues. Further, Dr. Yennello and Ms. Kaunas met with Dr. Joan Bennett, Rutgers University ADVANCE PI, when she was on campus as part of the ADVANCE Speaker Series.

Jennifer McCloud-Mann, mathematics faculty and Associate Dean for the College of Arts & Sciences at UT-Tyler (UTT), contacted the TAMU ADVANCE team requesting a site visit to discuss recruitment and retention of women STEM faculty at their campus. Dr. Yennello and Ms. Kaunas are in the process of planning a visit that will be based on the American Physical Society's Gender Equity Conversations. They will also speak with the UTT team about the ADVANCE program.

Dr. Stephanie Payne has been in communication with Dr. Laura Koppes Bryan at the University

of West Florida about her recently awarded ADVANCE-PAID grant. Campus climate surveys will be shared between the two institutions.

UPCOMING EVENTS

- The Faculty Forum on Awards, led by a panel of STEM Deans and Department Heads, is scheduled for March 2.
- A 2-day mediation training specifically for Department Heads is scheduled for March 5-6.
- Candidate nominations for the Administrative Fellows will be reviewed by the Activity Committee upon their due date of March 15.
- The ADVANCE Speaker Series will host the following speakers during the next reporting period:
 - Laura Greene, Swanlund Professor of Physics, Uofl, Urbana/Champaign (March 19-20)
 - Maria Flytzani-Stephanopoulos, Raytheon Professor of Pollution Prevention, Chemical Engineering, Tufts University (April 19-21)
- The Roadmap Workshop will take place March 26-28.
- The next round of Departmental Mini-Grant proposals are due March 30.
- Dr. Sue Rankin, Associate Professor of Education Policy Studies at The Pennsylvania State University, will be on campus for a conference on sexual orientation and sports. ADVANCE has invited her to talk about her work related to the state of higher education for the LGBT community with a specific focus on the STEM fields (April 4).
- The conference for the ADVANCE Scholars Program is scheduled for October 11-12, 2012.

PROGRAM ACTIVITIES

Overview: There are a total of 12 ADVANCE activities that are designed to increase gender equity by transforming Texas A&M University for women STEM faculty. Each activity is aligned with one or more of the five Psychologically Healthy Workplace (PHW) practices – the underlying, evidence-based framework for this initiative. The activities are organized into 3 broad categories: Climate Change, Success Enhancement and Recruitment and Retention. Each category has two Co-Chairs that oversee the related activities, an Activity Leader, and a committee made up of individuals from various units throughout the university. Each of the 12 activities is being evaluated separately and collectively as a part of an overarching analysis of institutional transformation. Social science research studies are being conducted in concert with 6 of the activities.

CLIMATE CHANGE

Co-Chairs - Christine Stanley and Mary Jo Richardson

Workplace climate is a major factor affecting women STEM faculty's success and efficacy at Texas A&M. In order to address this, the ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is engaged in 5 Climate Change Activities which are designed to improve the work environment by reducing bias. Christine Stanley, Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity, and Mary Jo Richardson, Regents Professor, Department of Oceanography, Co-Chair this effort.

LEAD Program

Activity Leader - Simon Sheather

Activity Summary: The ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is collaborating with the Dean of Faculties and the Office of the Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity to enhance existing diversity training for current and newly appointed Department Heads. The goal of the LEAD Program is to expand training related to implicit bias and provide further support to help Department Heads improve departmental climate for all faculty and meet diversity goals related to women STEM faculty. To that end, the committee is establishing a leadership program for Department Heads that will provide workshops each semester (and possibly during the summer sessions) that focus on issues related to department leadership; training related to implicit bias will be woven into each workshop.

Activity Update: The committee continues to work on the next LEAD workshop: Strategies for Faculty Retention. Vignettes are currently being developed, and scheduling the event is underway. As a continuation to the November LEAD workshop, "Conflict Management for Department Heads," a one and one-half day mediation training is scheduled for March 5-6, 2012.

Faculty-Staff Interaction

Activity Leader - Merna Jacobsen

Activity Summary: A positive working relationship between faculty and staff is critical to the success of the University. The ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is working to increase faculty and staff awareness of intentional or unintentional bias toward female faculty by expanding existing training related to gender equity and diversity. The first phase of this activity includes faculty and staff focus groups conducted to inform program design; however, the data will also be used as baseline information and focus groups will be conducted in the future for comparison purposes.

Activity Update: Four focus groups were conducted during this reporting period: one with male STEM faculty (N=8), one with female STEM faculty (N=8), and two with male/female STEM department staff (N=9; N=11). All four focus groups have been transcribed and unitized. The male STEM faculty coding is complete. Coding for the other three focus groups is underway. A summary report will be prepared for the committee (and will be submitted to the NSF) once the focus group data are analyzed.

Social Science Study Summary: This activity is the focus of one of the six ADVANCE social science research studies. The working title for this effort is “Reducing Staff & Student Implicit Biases: Campus Climate Perceptions before and after Diversity Workshops and Training.” ADVANCE Co-Investigator Kathi Miner is leading this analysis of longitudinal Campus Climate Survey data that assesses women STEM faculty’s perceptions of personal and vicarious experiences of disrespect from staff and undergraduate students (see Student Diversity Workshops below) before and after diversity training. The next Campus Climate Survey is tentatively scheduled for fall of 2012. A first draft of the climate survey will be generated in March of 2012.

Social Science Study Update: In an effort to get staff buy-in for the need for staff → faculty incivility training, the Social Science Research Team developed and administered a faculty → staff incivility survey. Institutional Review Board approval was received on 10/20/11 and data collection was completed on 2/24/12. After the initial recruitment invitation, potential participants received three reminders; two weeks after the last reminder the survey was closed. Two-hundred-twenty-three staff (79% female, 86% White) from ADVANCE Target Departments completed the survey for a 29% response rate. We are preparing the data file for analysis (e.g., creating scales). The data generated from this survey will supplement the analyses mentioned above.

Student Diversity Workshops

Activity Leader - CJ Woods

Activity Summary: In order to improve the workplace climate for women STEM faculty, the ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is engaged in an effort to teach students that respecting all faculty is part of the culture of Texas A&M. The Center is collaborating with members of the TAMU Performance Studies Department to develop interactive theater experiences that address issues of implicit bias, prejudices, and stereotypes of women and minorities. The theater experiences are spontaneous, surprise performances in public spaces for unsuspecting audiences (i.e., the audience does not know they are witnessing a performance).

Activity Update: To date, three female STEM faculty have been recruited to hold the “scripted performances” in their classrooms; scheduling is underway. The committee for this activity believes a far greater number of scenarios will have to be performed to affect change. **Best Idea Yet:** Additional strategizing has resulted in a proposed freshman seminar for the fall: “Theater for Social Change.” The boot camp training that was employed last summer will be part of the course and students will be required to perform the scenarios on campus. The hope is that this strategy provides a consistent stream of students who can perform the scenarios

which helps to institutionalize the program. A proposal for this course will be submitted to Undergraduate Studies in March.

Social Science Study Summary: The Student Diversity Workshops are being conducted in concert with two ADVANCE social science research studies. The **first** study, currently titled “Reducing Student Implicit Biases: Analysis of Course Evaluations before and after Student Diversity Workshops,” is led by Co-Principal Investigator Stephanie Payne. This study is a content analysis of students’ teaching evaluations pre- and post-student diversity workshops/performances and will examine whether or not women STEM faculty receive less disrespectful comments on their teaching evaluations after the student diversity performances. The **second** study, “Reducing Staff & Student Implicit Biases: Campus Climate Perceptions before and after Diversity Workshops and Training” is led by ADVANCE Co-Investigator Kathi Miner. This study is an analysis of longitudinal Campus Climate Survey data and will assess women STEM faculty’s perceptions of personal and vicarious experiences of disrespect from staff (see Faculty-Staff Interaction) and undergraduate students before and after diversity training.

Social Science Study Update: For the **first** study, the Social Science Research Team content coded qualitative comments in course evaluations for 114 (15 female) biology and engineering professors for the spring 2011 semester. They analyzed these data and summarized their findings in a manuscript submitted for presentation consideration to the Academy of Management annual conference. Conference submissions are peer-reviewed. Authors will be notified of acceptance in March. Contrary to expectation, quantitative scores indicated that female STEM professors were evaluated as effective as male STEM professors. They were also statistically equivalent on the inclusion of nine characteristics/terms coded from qualitative comments that they were predicted to differ on. The coding scheme was modified slightly and seven new undergraduate students were recruited and trained to assist with the coding. Fall 2011 course evaluation data for all STEM departments that collect online evaluations (14,353 evaluations) have been obtained and coding of these data have commenced. Data for non-STEM departments have also been requested.

For the **second** study, faculty responses to questions concerning interactions with students will be analyzed and compared to the 2009 climate survey data. The next Campus Climate Survey is tentatively scheduled for fall of 2012. A first draft of the climate survey will be generated in March of 2012.

Merit Pool Incentives

Activity Leader - Christine Stanley

Activity Summary: Christine Stanley, the Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity (VPAPD) and ADVANCE Co-Investigator, and her Council on Climate and Diversity (CCD) annually assess the progress made by each university unit (academic colleges as well as non-academic units) toward reaching diversity goals. The ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is working with Dr. Stanley’s office to leverage this new institutional practice to further the goals of the ADVANCE program (e.g. participant tracking for Departmental Mini-Grants serves both

ADVANCE and university diversity reporting requirements).

Activity Update: ADVANCE Co-Investigators Mindy Bergman and Kathi Miner continue to consult with various units through the Diversity Operations Committee (DOC) to assist them in meeting the assessment plan goals for their units. (The DOC is the operational committee formed under the 2009 TAMU Campus Diversity Plan to assist with ongoing planning, implementation, assessment, and evaluation of University and unit progress with respect to accomplishing goals related to accountability, climate, and equity.)

Departmental Mini Grants

Activity Leader - Al Boggess

Activity Summary: The aim of this activity is to support departments in their diversity efforts and to provide an avenue for strategies that promote the success of women STEM faculty at Texas A&M. Mini-grants for innovative projects are being awarded annually to individual departments based on how well the proposed projects support the goals of the ADVANCE program.

Activity Update: Mid-grant reports were due January 1; the activity committee is currently reviewing the reports. A Request for Proposals was sent out for the March 30 deadline.

SUCCESS ENHANCEMENT

Co-Chairs - Antonio Cepeda-Benito and Dorothy Shippen

The Success Enhancement component of ADVANCE activities is designed to foster the professional development of women STEM faculty. There are 3 Success Enhancement Activities that have been established to foster the professional development of women STEM faculty. Antonio Cepeda-Benito, Dean of Faculties and Associate Provost, and Dorothy Shippen, Department of Biochemistry & Biophysics, Co-Chair this effort.

ADVANCE Scholar Program

Activity Leaders - Christine Stanley and Becky Petitt

Activity Summary: The ADVANCE Scholar Program intends to increase likelihood of success of underrepresented women STEM faculty members, particularly women of color, by providing as mentors eminent scholars in their fields. The ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is also establishing a national conference for underrepresented women in STEM, the first of which is scheduled for October 11-12, 2012.

Activity Update: As previously report, 15 Scholars have been paired with an Internal Advocate and Mentor/Eminent Scholar. Since the last update, one additional scholar has traveled to meet with her mentor, bringing the total to five scholars who have made face-to-face contact with their Mentors/Eminent Scholars.

Planning for the October 11-12, 2012 conference is underway. The conference venue is our newly renovated Memorial Student Center. An invitation has been sent to Dr. Evelyn M. Hammonds, Dean of Harvard College and Barbara Gutmann Rosenkrantz Professor of the History of Science and of African and African American Studies at Harvard to serve as our

keynote speaker. Eminent Scholars who plan to attend the conference will be invited to share their knowledge and expertise through serving as session facilitators. The full conference agenda should be established no later than March 31, 2012.

In anticipation of receiving a new cohort, we have requested data for all eligible faculty in targeted colleges, made plans to host informational meetings for recruitment purposes, and have established May 1, 2012 as the deadline for applications. New Scholars will be notified of their acceptance no later than June 1, 2012.

Regarding assessment, Scholar and Mentor feedback will be sought through an online survey, and we are currently considering ways to gather assessment data during the October 2012 conference.

Social Science Study Summary: A study of the ADVANCE scholars, their internal advocates, and their external mentors is tentatively planned. A study design examining triads is consistent with the acknowledgement in the research literature that mentoring is not limited to dyadic relationships. Recognizing the ADVANCE scholars activity is targeted at a vulnerable population of individuals, we are carefully pursuing the best way to conduct this study without overburdening the participants. It is likely that we will set aside some time for the mentees and their mentors to complete surveys at the national conference for underrepresented women in STEM scheduled in October of 2012. We will seek IRB approval in late spring to conduct this study in the fall.

Administrative Fellow Program

Activity Leader - José Luis Bermúdez

Activity Summary: This activity provides opportunities for women STEM faculty at the associate or full professor level to serve in developmental assignments in the offices of the Provost, Deans of targeted colleges, Vice President for Research, VP and Associate Provost for Diversity, and the Dean of Faculties. Administrators are selected based on a proposed project, jointly developed by the faculty member with the college or administrative office, and supported jointly by the ADVANCE project and the host office.

Activity Update: The monthly lunch series for the Fellows to meet with campus administrators (President, Provost, VPs, Deans etc.) continues. In January, they met with the university President, R. Bowen Loftin. They are scheduled to meet next with Karen Butler-Purry, Associate Provost of Graduate Studies, and Karan Watson, Provost and Executive Vice President for Academic Affairs (and ADVANCE Co-PI). Additionally, arrangements are being made to have the hosts and Fellows meet separately with the activity committee to provide direct feedback on their experiences in those roles.

Looking ahead to the next cohort of Fellows, the committee received four position applications for the 2012-13 academic year (which starts in July) as follows:

Within the Office of the Provost and Executive Vice President for Faculty Affairs:

1. Assistant Provost (focus on High-Impact Learning development)

2. Assistant Provost (focus on QEP coordination and support)
3. Assistant Provost (focus on national benchmarking of faculty teaching and service)

Within the Office of the Dean of Faculties and Associate Provost:

4. Associate Dean for Faculty Advancement (focus on Faculty Mentoring or Interdisciplinary Programs)

Pending modifications, the committee approved any two positions in the Provost's office and the position in the Dean of Faculties office. Candidates will be submitted to the committee for confirmation by March 15.

Social Science Study Summary: In conjunction with this activity, Mindy Bergman is conducting interviews with the Administrative Fellows and their colleagues. The working title of the study is "Advancing Women into Leadership Positions: Effectiveness of the Administrative Fellows Program." The goal of this study is to develop a thick-description case study of women entering academic leadership and administration for the first time via a part-time, short duration position. The research questions focus on the changing beliefs and expectations of Fellows throughout their first year in administration, the fit of the position into the administrative unit (as this type of position is relatively unusual at Texas A&M), and the effect on a variety of psychologically healthy workplace outcomes (e.g., work-life balance) and career trajectories as a typical faculty member (e.g., research productivity, student mentoring). All Administrative Fellows will be interviewed at three points during their first year of appointment (beginning, middle, end). Additionally, the sponsor of the position (i.e., the unit head) as well as several peers and support staff will be interviewed at the beginning and end of the first year of each Fellow's appointment.

Social Science Study Update: To date, the first two sets of interviews have been completed in the College of Liberal Arts, the Office of the VP for Diversity, and the Dean of Faculties office for both Fellows and their colleagues (17 interviews total). Semi-structured interview protocols were developed for both the Fellows and their colleagues. Questions probe the efficacy and fit of the position into the host unit (all respondents), components of the psychologically healthy workplace model (especially work-life balance; Fellows), and the effects of joining administration on faculty career trajectories such as maintaining an active research program (all respondents). Qualitative analyses will be conducted. Transcription is in progress, so analyses have not yet begun. First round interviews with Fellows and colleagues were conducted in early Fall 2011; mid-term interviews with Fellows were completed by mid-February 2012. We are also planning on expanding our research protocol to include an additional interview with Fellows, as the first group of Fellows all appear to be remaining in their position or in administration in general for at least one more year.

Success Circles

Activity Leader - Jane Welsh

Activity Summary: The ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is organizing mentoring groups centered on personal and professional interests. This activity functions as a complement to existing one-on-one mentoring (Women's Faculty Network, the Mexican American Latino

Faculty Association and the Black Faculty Alliance) and facilitates the development of social connections among women faculty with the goal of greater satisfaction and well-being. Because this activity has not yielded mentoring groups, the social science study originally planned to align with this activity has been abandoned and the corresponding IRB protocol closed.

Activity Update: Two Success Circles were the focus of this reporting period. First, a local personal trainer has started a four week “Fitness for Academics” program for women STEM faculty. Nine people attended the first meeting in early February. The sessions include time for a light workout, Q&A regarding fitness and nutrition, and encouragement to engage in fitness activities with peers outside the sessions.

The second Success Circle is a Grant Writing Club for women STEM faculty who plan to submitting NSF CAREER Grants in July. Thirteen women have expressed interest in club. Two facilitators have committed to the effort, one who has expertise in “power writing” and good writing habits and one with expertise in NSF grant writing. Programming is currently being established. It is anticipated that a kickoff event will be scheduled for March with the additional meetings every other week thereafter until submission. Individual assistance will be provided by the facilitator with NSF grant writing experience.

RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION

Co-Chairs - Robin Autenreith and Sarah Bednarz

While the number and diversity of women faculty at Texas A&M University has seen recent gains, a great need still exists to attract and keep women of excellence in the STEM fields. To that end, the ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty has established 4 activities focused on Recruitment and Retention of women STEM faculty. Robin Autenrieth, Co-PI and Associate Dean of Graduate Studies in the College of Engineering, and Sarah Bednarz, Associate Dean of Geography, are Co-Chairs for this effort.

Area of Difficulty/Resistance: The evaluator for the Recruitment and Retention Activities, Eric Lindquist, is leaving the university. A plan has been implemented to transition his assigned activities to other members of the Evaluation Team as follows:

Roadmap Workshop – Edwina Dorch
Award & Search Committee Training – Lori Taylor
ADVANCE Speaker Series – Angela Bies
Faculty Recognition Committee – Angela Bies

Dr. Lindquist is meeting with the other members of the Evaluation Team to bring them up to speed on his evaluation efforts to date. The Program Director will meet with the Evaluation Team to ensure a smooth transition.

Roadmap Workshop

Activity Leader - Ben Wu

Activity Summary: Formerly the Workshop for Early Career Academics, this activity is designed for internal (A&M) and external (non-A&M) post-doctoral researchers and Assistant Professors (in the first two years of their position) in STEM fields. The purpose of these annual workshops is to assist departments in the recruitment and retention of women STEM faculty.

Activity Update: The first Roadmap for a Successful Academic Career workshop will take place March 26-28, 2012. To date, 41 women have confirmed attendance. The committee continues to plan the workshop sessions and travel plans for attendees are being made.

Social Science Study: Kathi Miner is conducting a study currently titled “Repairing the Leaky Pipeline: Workshops for Early Career Academics.” This survey study investigates whether workshop attendees report higher levels of self-efficacy for negotiating and, in turn, higher levels of well-being than post-doctoral non-workshop attendees. The sample will consist of all post-doctoral researchers and Assistant Professors who participate in the workshop. Attendees will be asked to nominate a comparable friend (e.g., female colleague from graduate school at a similar rank) who will also complete the survey; these non-attendees will serve as a comparison group.

Social Science Study Update: Construction of the online survey is complete and is currently is under consideration with the IRB.

Award and Search Committee Training

Activity Leader – César Malavé, Industrial and Systems Engineering

Activity Summary: The Dean of Faculties and the ADVANCE Center for Women faculty are working together to expand existing gender bias training for all members of review committees including search committees, committees making decisions on university and college awards, and committees making decisions on tenure and promotion.

Activity Update: The previous leader for this activity, Ray Juzaitis, recently left the university. César Malavé, Interim Department Head for Industrial and Systems Engineering, is the new Activity Leader. **Area of Difficulty/Resistance** - This is the third leader for this activity and the

discontinuity has slowed progress and impacted group dynamics. However, the work on modifying the University of Michigan's STRIDE presentation to make it relevant for the Texas A&M campus continues. In addition to this, two colleges, Geosciences and Engineering, have a number of searches underway. (In particular, the College of Engineering has five Department Head searches underway.) While the STRIDE presentation is not yet ready for implementation, the committee and the college's diversity leaders (Malavé is the diversity leader for Engineering) decided some action was required. Consequently, Drs. Yennello and Malave and the Program Director met with Geosciences search committee members (N=5) to discuss search strategies. Implicit bias, however, was not directly addressed in order to maintain an "untreated" group for the social science study that is being conducted in concert with this activity. Scheduling to meet with the College of Engineering is underway.

Social Science Study: One of the six social science studies will be conducted around this activity; the study is currently titled "Improving Selection and Promotion of STEM Women Faculty: Reducing Search and Award Committee Biases." Mindy Bergman will conduct this quasi-experimental study of administrators' selection and promotion decisions. The basic hypothesis for the social science study is that training will increase knowledge of equal opportunity laws and decrease explicit sex biases substantially as well as decrease implicit sex biases more moderately. The current plan is to use a Solomon 4-group design to compare pre-/post- training attitudes and knowledge regarding implicit sex biases and equal opportunity laws.

Social Science Study Update: Instruments for the social sciences study are in development as the course content becomes clearer. Current plans include using an implicit attitudes test, explicit attitudes measures (including Hostile and Benevolent Sexism, among others), and ratings of stimulus (faux) applicant folders and differences in ratings based on sex.

ADVANCE Speaker Series

Activity Leaders - Nancy Amato, Jennifer Welch, and Jodie Lutkenhaus

Activity Summary: The ADVANCE Speaker Series has two goals: 1) to bring in one or two senior women scientists and engineers per year who have also been active in gender and diversity issues to speak and 2) to bring in mid-career and senior women scientists and engineers that are nominated by STEM departments for recruiting purposes.

Activity Update: The committee for this activity received nine submissions for the December, 2011 deadline. Three speakers were selected:

- Laura Greene, Swanlund Professor of Physics, UofI, Urbana/Champaign
- Maria Flytzani-Stephanopoulos, Raytheon Professor of Pollution Prevention, Chemical Engineering, Tufts University
- Susan Fiske, Eugene Higgins Professor of Psychology, Princeton University
 - Scheduled for fall, 2012

An additional speaker was part of this series as well: Dr. Joan Bennett, Plant Biology and Pathology, Rutgers University and ADVANCE PI at that institution. Dr. Bennett was the committee's choice as a first speaker for the series. However, due to scheduling conflicts she was not able to come to campus until this semester (February 14-15). The Biology Department hosted Dr. Bennett. Event details are pending.

Faculty Recognition

Activity Leader - Elena Castell-Perez

Activity Summary: This activity is focused on highlighting the success of women STEM faculty. In collaboration with the Dean of Faculties office, the Women's Faculty Network, the Women Engineering Faculty Interest Group, the Women Administrators Network, and the Vice President of Research, the ADVANCE Center for Women Faculty is organizing events to recognize and publicize the achievements of women faculty.

Activity Update: Planning for the faculty forum on awards is complete. The event, led by a panel of Deans and Department Heads and moderated by the leader for this activity (see panelist questions in Table 1 below), is scheduled for March 2. All tenured and tenure-track faculty have been invited. An event support brochure has been developed based on the WISELI document "Advancing Your Career through Awards and Recognitions." The brochure will be disseminated at the event. The committee is now working on a plan to engage individual departments on the process for nominating women faculty with greater equity.

Table 1
Faculty Forum on Awards
Panelist Questions

1. Can you please describe why awards are important to the University, the colleges and departments, and how it impacts individual faculty?
2. Can you share some strategies or best practices for nominating and selecting exceptional and diverse candidates?
3. Certain awards allow a limited number of nominations. How are nominees selected in your college and what proactive measures are being done in your college to recognize faculty achievement?
4. NSF funded-research indicates that women receive awards at a lower rate than men, the awards they receive are predominantly for service and teaching, and implicit bias on the part of reviewers influences award nominations and selections. What evidence have you seen of this in the university community and what can be done to prevent it?
5. How are various faculty recognitions evaluated for Promotion & Tenure in your college and overall?
6. How do awards figure into your strategic plan and what processes have you put in place to address the issue?
7. What role do colleagues play in award nomination and selection?
8. Can you please discuss what type of awards have the greatest impact on an individual's career and why?
9. What is the role of local/internal awards in positioning a faculty member for national recognition?
10. What suggestions do you have for faculty to ensure that their work is recognized for awards?
11. Can you please provide an example of someone who has received an award and discuss how it impacted their career?
12. Can you please describe how awards are managed in your department to ensure equity? What strategies are employed to ensure impartiality?
13. Can you please tell us about an award that you have received and how you feel it has impacted your career?

EVALUATION UPDATE

The ADVANCE program at TAMU encompasses a series of interrelated interventions designed to change the climate, enhance professional success, and improve the recruitment and retention of female faculty. Untangling the degree to which the various interventions interact with one another would be nearly impossible. Therefore, the Evaluation team is focusing on a more comprehensive analysis of institutional transformation. This analysis will be based on university wide data on faculty climate, faculty recruitment and retention, space allocations, start-up packages, and salaries. In all cases, a difference-in-difference approach will be used to assess whether or not ADVANCE activities can help to explain changes over time. The underlying hypothesis is that departments which have been more engaged with ADVANCE will show greater improvements in climate, retention, recruitment, and resource balance over time.

Table 2 below indicates the ADVANCE activity data that are being collected or will be collected by the Evaluation team for use in the analysis of institutional transformation.

Table 2 ADVANCE Activities and the Evaluation Data for the Analysis of Institutional Transformation	
Activity	Evaluation Data Being Collected
LEAD Program	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of which department heads have participated in diversity training, and how many hours of training they have received.
Departmental Mini Grants	Data collected from this effort includes all application forms submitted, information on awardee departments, minutes and notes taken from ADVANCE mini-grant committee meetings on process/program design, and the progress reports.
Faculty-Staff Interaction	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of the number of faculty and staff from each department who have participated in the Faculty-Staff Interaction Workshops.
Merit Pool Incentives	The Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity maintains these data. Note: Since the inception of ADVANCE, the Merit Pool Incentive has been dormant due to budgetary constraints. If and when these incentives are reinstated, the investigators will utilize data on whether or not each department receives funding through this program and the amount of funding each department receives. If possible, investigators will also utilize data on the process by which the awards were granted.

Table 2 (continued)
ADVANCE Activities and the Evaluation Data
for the Analysis of Institutional Transformation

Activity	Evaluation Data Being Collected
Student Diversity Workshops	The evaluators will compare summary statistics from the TAMU student evaluations for treated sections with summary statistics on student evaluations for untreated sections.
ADVANCE Speaker Series	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of the number of faculty from each department who have attended each speech, and the number of speakers proposed by each department, and the demographics of speakers in previous years.
Award and Search Committee Training	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database on the number of award and search committee members who have participated in diversity training, by department, and how many hours of training they have received.
Faculty Recognition	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of all award events and all faculty receiving awards.
Roadmap Workshop	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of all departments proposing candidates for the workshop, the demographic characteristics of all women attending the workshops and indicators for whether or not attendees were eventually hired by TAMU or another research institution.
Administrative Fellow Program	Data collected from this effort include all applications, information on awardees, minutes and notes taken from ADVANCE Administrative Fellow Program committee meetings on process/program design, and progress reports
ADVANCE Scholar Program	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database on all faculty who participate in the program and track their participation in professional development activities (publications, conference presentations, etcetera).
Success Circles	The ADVANCE Center is compiling a database of the departmental affiliations of all faculty members who participate in the program.

As is always the case with non-experimental research designs, there are other factors outside of our control that offer an alternative explanation for any institutional change. Table 3 below indicates some of the additional data that are being collected by the investigators on this project.

Table 3
Non-ADVANCE Activities and the Corresponding Evaluation Data

Non-ADVANCE Climate Activity	Evaluation Data Being Collected
<p>The Diversity Plan Grant: This collaborative effort will fund \$10,000 (Five \$2000 grants) for student-run initiatives that align with the TAMU Diversity Plan. The funding will be made available for recognized student organizations to create an initiative, or improve an existing initiative, that specifically supports one or more priorities of the Diversity Plan (Accountability, Climate, and Equity). http://diversity.tamu.edu/Documents/DiversityPlan.pdf.</p>	<p>The Vice President and Associate Provost for Diversity maintains these data. The investigators will utilize data on whether or not each department receives funding through this program and the amount of funding each department receives. If possible, investigators will also utilize data on the process by which the grants were awarded</p>
<p>Graduate Diversity Fellowships: These fellowships were established to attract students to TAMU who have a proven record of success in a diverse environment. Academic departments nominate prospective graduate students, and recipients are selected based on overall merit and the nominating department's statement of support. http://ogs.tamu.edu/prospective-students/funding-information/fellowships/faculty-nominated-fellowships/</p>	<p>The TAMU Office of Graduate Studies maintains these data and will share it with the investigators. Data collected from this effort will include publically available information on awardees from 2008-2016.</p>
<p>Teaching Excellence Award Program: The TAMU System's voluntary, student-selected Teaching Excellence Award Program was created to recognize excellence in classroom teaching. Individuals of all teaching levels will be eligible for awards based on students' responses from the uniform faculty evaluation form in eligible courses. The program was piloted in Fall 2008, expanded to include all 11 A&M System campuses in 2009, and suspended in 2011. http://www.tamus.edu/offices/academic/student-recognition-award-for-teaching-excellence/</p>	<p>The TAMU System Office of the Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs houses this information. Data collected from this effort will include all publically available information from awardees by department for the period of 2008- until the program's suspension in 2011.</p>

As part of the analysis of institutional transformation, the data from Table 2 will be used to develop measures indicating the extent to which each TAMU department has engaged with the ADVANCE program. Scales will measure the degree of departmental engagement as a function of participation in ADVANCE activities and in ADVANCE design efforts. Similarly, the

data from Table 3 will be used to develop measures indicating the extent to which each TAMU department has engaged with other diversity and climate change efforts on campus.

Recent work by the Evaluation team has focused on:

- Identifying and starting to compile the data needed for the analysis of institutional transformation (see Tables 2 and 3);
- seeking IRB approval of the analysis plan;
- helping the University clean and compile the administrative data on space allocations and start-up packages;
- conducting the baseline analysis of faculty retention and
- assembling preliminary data on departmental engagement with ADVANCE

The baseline retention analysis is ongoing. The Evaluation team is using regression analysis to examine faculty retention for the fiscal years 2001 to 2011. With the exception of a handful of outliers, all tenured or tenure-track faculty with at least a half-time appointment in a STEM department are being included in the analysis. Faculty members in non-STEM departments are being excluded from the baseline analysis of the two colleges that blend STEM and non-STEM departments (the College of Agriculture and Life Sciences and the College of Liberal Arts). Preliminary analysis suggests that there are no gender differentials in turnover, given faculty demographics and departmental affiliations. Subsequent analysis will examine the extent to which differences in departmental climate help to explain the historical pattern of turnover among women faculty.

The space allocation analysis will rely on newly developed data on space allocations at TAMU. Baseline data were collected by the facilities department in 2012 and are in the process of being cleaned by the ADVANCE evaluation team. These data will be the first to link individual records for TAMU faculty with descriptive characteristics of specific offices and laboratories. The baseline analysis will examine the extent to which there are gender differences in the allocation of office or laboratory spaces, conditional on the appropriate demographic characteristics of faculty. Subsequent analysis will examine changes, if any, in the gender pattern of space allocation.

The analysis of start-up packages will rely on data currently under development by the Dean of Faculties office. Departments have been asked to provide such data for each new hire since 2005. Negotiations about the format for such data are ongoing.

The baseline salary analysis has been completed. (See Appendix A.) This analysis examines faculty salaries for the fiscal years 2001 to 2011. The baseline analysis examines the salary history for each tenured or tenure-track faculty member using a series of linear mixed models (also referred to as hierarchical linear models, or multilevel models). Because we had no reason to believe that the salary patterns were the same across colleges, the Evaluation team estimated separate salary models for each STEM college in the university. Faculty members in non-STEM departments were excluded from the baseline analysis of the two colleges that blend STEM and non-STEM departments (the College of Agriculture and Life Sciences and the College of Liberal Arts). With the exception of a handful of outliers, all tenured or tenure-track faculty with at least a half-time appointment in a STEM department were included in the analysis.

As Appendix A illustrates, the two colleges that blend STEM and non-STEM departments were also the only two ADVANCE colleges at TAMU with a statistically significant difference in monthly salaries for male and female STEM faculty. In the STEM departments of the College of Agriculture and Life Sciences, female assistant professors with average demographics earned 6 percent less than male assistant professors with the same demographic profile. Gender differences in salary among faculty of higher ranks were not statistically significant. In the STEM departments of the College of Liberal Arts, male associate professors earned 8 percent more than female assistant professors, on average. Again, gender differences in salary among full professors were not statistically significant. There is no evidence that salaries are systematically related to gender in the remaining STEM colleges.

Ongoing analyses are testing for changes in the gender differential during the ADVANCE grant period, and whether or not the degree of departmental engagement with ADVANCE and/or the nature of that engagement help to explain the gender differential

APPENDIX A

For inquiries related to the Baseline Salary Analysis that was submitted as required to the NSF, please contact Chris Kaunas at (979) 845-1197